

Improving **pandemic preparedness** and **management**

Group of Chief Scientific Advisors to the European Commission
European Group on Ethics in Science and New Technologies (EGE)
Special advisor to President Ursula von der Leyen on the response
to the coronavirus and COVID-19
Joint Opinion, October 2020

Independent Expert Report



Read the full Joint Opinion Improving pandemic preparedness and management.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The COVID-19 pandemic has painfully confirmed that the world has been underprepared for large outbreaks of emerging infectious diseases. The EU is responding to, and learning from, the COVID-19 crisis, with new policy initiatives brought forward by the European Commission on better preparedness for future health threats.

To support and inform that process, we as science and ethics advisors have examined the responses to the COVID-19 and, in part, to previous pandemics, drawing on insights from research and scholarship and taking European values and respect for fundamental rights as critical orientation. This work has revealed important lessons learned and to be learned, on the basis of which we have formulated a range of recommendations that are summarised below.

Prevent and pre-empt

Support multifaceted efforts to investigate, map and reduce the risk
of emerging infectious diseases globally, including the surveillance of
pathogen reservoirs, mitigation, forecasting and early detection of potential
outbreaks.

- Support a combination of complementary approaches for accelerating the research on and development of responses to pathogens with epidemic and pandemic potential.
- Strengthen multi- and cross-disciplinary research on pandemic prevention, preparedness, responses and impacts, analysing the multi-faceted societal aspects and consequences of health crises.

Enhance coordination across Member States and at international level

- Establish a standing EU advisory body for health threats and crises, including epidemics and pandemics. This body should liaise with advisory bodies in the Member States as well as at EU and global level. It should have a multidisciplinary and inclusive membership so it can advise on biomedical, behavioural, social, economic, cultural, ethical, legal, technological and international aspects. Monitoring efforts of different Member States could be assembled in a European Dashboard that shares and coordinates key indicators and information from all Member States about the medical, economic and social impacts to enable real-time comparisons and collective actions, where appropriate.
- Ensure that monitoring efforts are comprehensive, evidence-based, rapidly shared and well coordinated across the EU, enabling strategic decisions in response to the situation at hand, insights through real-time comparisons, as well as collective action where appropriate.
- **Establish a joint early-response mechanism** to contain epidemics and pandemics, including a toolbox of strategies, such as testing, tracing, isolating and other containment measures. Any strategy needs to be based on scientific evidence, guided by the fundamental rights framework and applied in a situation-dependent manner. Herd immunity is a concept best applied in the context of vaccine-acquired immunity. Achieving herd immunity through natural infection by a previously unknown pathogen involving risks to life and health conflicts with the WHO's ethical framework and its multi-principled approach, requiring that utility and equity considerations are balanced, and would imply practical challenges regarding the protection of vulnerable populations.
- Coordinate research and the development and implementation of medical countermeasures during a pandemic or other health threat. Crucial scientific questions should be clarified as quickly as possible after the onset of a health crisis to rapidly inform effective and safe public health measures. European and global collaboration in these efforts should be reinforced to increase their overall impact.

• Coordinate research and the development and evaluation of social measures to mitigate harm and to increase resilience in case of pandemics or other public health crises. Social, economic, psychosocial, ethical, legal and cultural challenges raised by a pandemic should be addressed as quickly as possible after its onset to inform a range of nuanced and locally appropriate measures, ranging from inclusive emergency financial aid schemes to ad-hoc strengthening of institutions providing community support.

Strengthen systems for preparedness and management

- Encourage Member States to provide healthcare for all, respecting the principles of justice and solidarity and adhering to the commitments established in the context of European fundamental rights instruments, such as the European Pillar of Social Rights, and the Sustainable Development Goals. They should account for the resources needed to maintain high-quality, evidence-based continuity of care of people with other health problems and enable long-term care institutions to ensure better preparedness.
- Ensure robust and equitable access to critical products and services
 for all EU citizens and demonstrate global solidarity. This involves preemptively providing fair criteria for the allocation, among and within Member
 States, of limited resources essential to manage a pandemic and mitigate
 harm, with due regard to the moral equality of all persons.
- Encourage Member States to strengthen public health infrastructure
 as an essential part of efficient and equitable health services, for
 example by creating interoperable and interconnected health information
 systems; developing rapid and reliable testing and tracing systems supported
 by laboratory networks and monitoring capabilities; building public health
 workforce capacity; and strengthening community infrastructures of social
 care.
- Establish systems for effective risk communication and tackling disinformation and misinformation during crises, and strengthen the ECDC's role also in this regard. Develop communication strategies for advice and policy that are evidence-based, fit for purpose, flexible and nuanced and that counter stigmatising and homogenising discourses that serve to exclude and marginalise.
- Together with EU Member States, develop strategies to sustain education in all sectors and in accordance with the Digital Education Plan 2021-2027. The closure of educational institutions touches on several key

- areas of society and has long-lasting social, economic, medical and psychosocial consequences. It should be carried out with utmost restraint.
- Encourage Member States to strengthen efforts in community involvement and organisation and support civil-society organisations, providing a critical part of the intensified social and care work, during health crises and beyond.
- Foster appropriate engineering and other controls in public buildings to limit indoors infection risks for airborne diseases. Among them are sufficient and effective ventilation, particle filtration, air disinfection and avoiding air recirculation and overcrowding.

Uphold fundamental rights and strengthen social justice

- Uphold highest standards in the protection of fundamental rights and civil liberties during pandemics. In the rare case of encroachments on rights and liberties to limit harm and risks during pandemics they should be considered with utmost care, be explicitly limited in time, continuously reviewed and justified with respect to their necessity and proportionality and lifted as soon as possible.
- **Implement the European Pillar of Social Rights**, for example by extending social security benefits to workers in non-standard and precarious employment and updating policies towards an appropriate acknowledgement of the value of care work; by addressing housing security to protect people without homes and in poor housing conditions; and by mitigating educational, domestic, sexual and gender-based risks during a pandemic.

Find solidarity-based and sustainable ways of living

• Take action in a crosscutting manner upon the increasing body of knowledge about unsustainable ways of living, which also contribute to the emergence of epidemics and pandemics. This includes addressing the links between health crises and environmental degradation and acting upon them in related fields, such as environmental protection, food, transport and urban planning. It also includes addressing the links between health crises, poverty and structural inequalities and acting upon them in related fields, such as employment, housing, social and economic aspects of ageing, gender and migration.

JOINT ADVISORS

Group of Chief Scientific Advisors

Pearl Dykstra Professor of Sociology, Erasmus University Rotterdam

(Deputy Chair)

Elvira Fortunato Professor of Materials Science at the Faculty of Science

and Technology, NOVA University, Lisbon

Nicole Grobert Professor of Nanomaterials at the Department of Materials

in the University of Oxford

Rolf-Dieter Heuer Former Director-General of the European Organization for

(Chair) Nuclear Research (CERN), Geneva

Carina Keskitalo Professor of Political Science, Department of Geography,

Umeå University

Paul Nurse Director of the Francis Crick Institute, London

Éva Kondorosi Professor, Research Director of the Institute of Plant

Biology, Biological Research Centre, Hungarian Academy

of Sciences Centre of Excellence, Szeged

Former member

Janusz Bujnicki Professor of Biology, International Institute of Molecular

and Cell Biology, Warsaw

European Group on Ethics in Science and New Technologies (EGE)

Emmanuel Agius Professor of philosophical and theological ethics and Dean of

the Faculty of Theology, University of Malta

Anne Cambon-Thomsen Emeritus Research Director at CNRS; member of research

units at Inserm and University Toulouse III Paul Sabatier

Ana Sofia Carvalho Professor of Bioethics and Director of the Institute of

Bioethics, Catholic University of Portugal; former Chair of the

Portuguese UNESCO Chair in Bioethics

Eugenijus Gefenas Professor and Director of the Department of Medical History

and Ethics, Vilnius University; Director of the Lithuanian

Bioethics Committee

Julian Kinderlerer Emeritus Professor of Intellectual Property Law, University of

Cape Town; former EGE President

Andreas Kurtz Biologist at Berlin-Brandenburg Center for Regenerative

Therapies, Charité Universitätsmedizin Berlin; Head of the

human pluripotent stem cell registry

Herman Nys Emeritus Professor in medical law, KU Leuven; editor-in-

chief of the European Journal of Health Law and editor of the

International Encyclopaedia of Medical Law

Siobhán O'Sullivan

(Deputy Chair)

(Deputy Chair)

Lecturer in Health Care Ethics and Law, Royal College of Surgeons; former Chief Bioethics Officer, Ministry of Health,

Ireland

Laura Palazzani Professor of Philosophy of law and biolaw, Lumsa University

Rome; member of the UNESCO International Bioethics

Committee; Vice Chair of the Italian Committee for Bioethics

Barbara Prainsack Professor at the Department of Political Science, University

of Vienna, and at the Department of Global Health & Global

Medicine, King's College London

Carlos Maria Romeo

Casabona

Professor of Criminal Law; Director, Chair in Law and the Human Genome, University of the Basque Country; member

of the Bioethics Committee of Spain

Nils-Eric Sahlin Professor of Medical Ethics, Lund University; member of The

Royal Swedish Academy of Letters, History and Antiquities; Chairman of The Swedish Research Council's Expert Group

on Ethics

Marcel Jeroen Van den

Hoven

Professor of Ethics and Technology at Delft University of

Technology; founding Editor in Chief of Ethics and

Information Technology

Christiane Woopen

(Chair)

Professor for Ethics and Theory of Medicine, University of Cologne; Executive Director of the Cologne Center for Ethics, Rights, Economics, and Social Sciences of Health; former member of the UNESCO International Bioethics Committee;

former Chair of the German Ethics Council

Special Advisor to the President of the European Commission on the response to the coronavirus and COVID-19

Peter Piot

Director of the London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine (LSHTM) and Handa Professor of Global Health

Contacts:

EC Group of Chief Scientific Advisors (GCSA)

E-mail: EC-SAM@ec.europa.eu

#SAMGroup_EU

Website: Group of Chief Scientific Advisors

European Group on Ethics in Science and New Technologies (EGE)

E-mail: EC-ETHICS-GROUP@ec.europa.eu

#EthicsGroup EU

Website: European Group on Ethics in Science and New Technologies



© European Union, 2020

Reuse of this document is allowed, provided appropriate credit is given and any changes are indicated (Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International license). For any use or reproduction of elements that are not owned by the EU, permission may need to be sought directly from the respective right holders.

All images © European Union, unless otherwise stated. Images: ©Visual Generation, #214618774; #327652788; #268735316; #343588402; #345452485; #347901138; 2020. Source: stock.adobe.com

ISBN 978-92-76-25351-8, doi: 10.2777/280654, KI-03-20-765-EN-N